The opinion in support of the decision being entered today was *not* written for publication and is *not* binding precedent of the Board.

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

Ex parte GARRETT N. FORD

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570 Technology Center 3600

Decided: May 17, 2007

Before DONALD E. ADAMS, LORA M. GREEN, and RICHARD M. LEBOVITZ, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Adams, Administrative Patent Judge.

DECISION ON APPEAL

This appeal under 35 U.S.C. § 134 involves claims 1-4 and 13-17, the only claims pending in this application. We have jurisdiction under 35 U.S.C. § 6(b).

INTRODUCTION

The claims are directed to a bushing (claims 13-17) and a stirrup comprising, *inter alia*, a bushing (claims 1-4). Claims 1, 13, and 15 are illustrative:

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570

1. A stirrup comprising:

a carrier;

a holding member on said carrier for holding a strap;

a footrest joined to said carrier; and

a bushing mounted on said holding member;

wherein the bushing includes an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the holding member, longitudinal fins extending radially from the inner sleeve, and an outer sleeve connected to said fins.

13. A bushing for a stirrup holding member comprising:

an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the holding member;

an outer sleeve substantially concentric with the inner sleeve; and

a plurality of longitudinal ribs connecting the inner and outer sleeves.

15. The bushing of claim 13, wherein said bushing is made of polyurethane.

The Examiner relies on the following prior art references to show unpatentability:

Bowman

US 3,515,417

Jun. 2, 1970

Hsi-Chang

US 6,220,004 B1

Apr. 24, 2001

This Merits Panel relies on the following reference:

(Webster's) Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary 154 (10th ed. 1998).

The rejections as presented by the Examiner are as follows:

- 1. Claims 13 and 14 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman (Br. 4).
- 2. Claims 15-17 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman (Br. 4).
- 3. Claims 1-4 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman (Br. 4).

We reverse.

DISCUSSION

CLAIM INTERPRETATION

Claim 13 is drawn to a bushing. The Specification does not include a definition for the term "bushing." Therefore, we interpret the term "bushing" as defined in a general purpose dictionary to mean a "removable cylindrical lining for an opening (as a mechanical part) used to limit the size of the opening, resist abrasion, or serve as a guide" (Webster's). The bushing of claim 13 comprises three elements: (1) an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the stirrup holding member (e.g., the rod of a stirrup (Specification 4)), (2) an outer sleeve substantially concentric with the inner sleeve, and (3) a plurality of longitudinal ribs connecting the inner and outer sleeves.

Claim 1 is drawn to a stirrup. The stirrup comprises four elements: (1) a carrier; (2) a holding member on the carrier for holding a strap; (3) a footrest joined to the carrier; and (4) a bushing, as in claim 13, mounted on the holding member.

BOWMAN

Bowman teaches a self-centering bushing (Bowman, title).

Bowman's bushing is preferably made from a plastic material, e.g., nylon (Bowman, col. 1, 11. 30-31). Bowman's bushing has

an accurately formed inner bore to receive an accurately formed rod, pedestal or the like [(e.g., a holding member)] and the outer surface of the bushing being provided with a multiplicity of longitudinally extending apline [sic]-like members, the outer ends of which are adapted to contact the bore of the member in which the bushing is placed, the splines being flexible enough at their outer ends to make the bushing self centering relative to the bore of the hub.

(Bowman, col. 1, ll. 30-39.) Bowman's bushing does not contain an outer sleeve that is substantially concentric with the inner sleeve.

Bowman describes the use of the bushing in the base of a swivel chair (Bowman, col. 1, 1.63 - col. 2, 1.51). Bowman teaches that the bushing is placed in a disposed hub in the swivel chair's base where the inner bore of the bushing is positioned to receive a rod-like pedestal attached to the upper portion of the chair (id.).

Claims 13 and 14 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman.

The Examiner finds that Bowman's bushing comprises an inner sleeve (bore) and a plurality of longitudinal fins (ribs) (Answer 3-4; Final Rejection 2). We agree that Bowman teaches, an inner sleeve and a plurality of longitudinal fins, two of the three limitations of Appellant's claim 13. As we understand the Examiner's argument, when Bowman's bushing is inserted in the disposed hub of a swivel chair's base, the disposed hub of the chair's base provides an outer sleeve for Bowman's bushing (*id.*).

Therefore, the Examiner is of the opinion that the disposed hub of the chair's base provides the third required element of Appellant's claim 13.

We appreciate the Examiner's construction of Appellant's claimed invention in light of Bowman. When interpreted broadly, the transitional phrase "comprising" opens the claim to read on elements that are not recited in Appellant's claim, e.g., a bushing together with a swivel chair base.

Georgia-Pacific Corp. v. United States Gypsum Co., 195 F.3d 1322, 1327, 52 USPQ2d 1590, 1595 (Fed. Cir. 1999).

However, as we have interpreted the term, a "bushing" is a removable cylindrical lining. As Appellant explains, "[a] bushing constitutes a discrete and distinct member. . ." (Br. 5). Therefore, to reach Appellant's claimed bushing, the prior art bushing must have all three of Appellant's claimed elements whether it is held in your hand or placed in the disposed hub of a swivel chair base. Bowman does not teach a bushing that contains an outer sleeve that is substantially concentric with the inner sleeve. Therefore, Bowman does not teach a bushing having the claimed structure.

Accordingly, we reverse the rejection of claims 13 and 14 under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman.

Claims 15-17 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman.

Claims 15-17 depend from and further limit claim 13 to, *inter alia*, a bushing that is made of polyurethane (claims 15 and 16), or wherein the plurality of longitudinal ribs consists of four ribs (claim 17). As discussed above, Bowman fails to teach a bushing having all three elements of Appellant's claim 13. The Examiner offers no explanation as to why a person of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made would

have found it prima facie obvious to add an outer sleeve to Bowman's selfcentering bushing.

Therefore, for the reasons set forth above, we reverse the rejection of claims 15-17 under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman.

HSI-CHANG AND BOWMAN

Claims 1-4 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman.

The Examiner finds that Hsi-Chang teaches a stirrup that comprises a bushing (Final Rejection 3; Answer 5). The Examiner finds that "Hsi-Chang is silent about the bushing includ[ing] an inner sleeve and longitudinal fins extending radially from the inner sleeve" (Final Rejection 3). To make up for the deficiencies in His-Chang, the Examiner relies on Bowman as discussed above (*id.*). The Examiner finds that it would have been prima facie obvious to substitute the bushing of Hsi-Chang with a functionally equivalent bushing having inner sleeve and fins as taught by Bowman, since both types of bushing would perform to guide or reduce friction between elements (Answer 5).

As discussed above, Bowman fails to teach a bushing with an outer sleeve. Therefore, the rejection fails even if it would have been obvious to substitute Bowman's bushing for Hsi-Chang's bushing. Accordingly, we reverse the rejection of claims 1-4 under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman.

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570

CONCLUSION

In summary, we reverse all grounds of rejection.

REVERSED

lbg

QUARLES & BRADY LLP ONE SOUTH CHURCH AVENUE, SUITE 1700 TUCSON AZ 85701-1621



Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary

TENTH EDITION

Merriam-Webster, Incorporated Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A.



分對於,這個企作的可能與學問的

A GENUINE MERRIAM WEBSTER

The name Webster alone is no guarantee of excellence. It is used by a number of publishers and may serve mainly to mislead an unwary buyer.

Merriam-Webster™ is the name you should look for when you consider the purchase of dictionaries or other fine reference books. It carries the reputation of a company that has been publishing since 1831 and is your assurance of quality and authority.

Copyright @:1998 by Merriam Webster, Incorporated

Philippines Copyright 1998 by Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Main entry under title:

Merriam-Webster's collegiate dictionary. - 10th ed.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-87779-708-0 (unindexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-709-9 (indexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-710-2 (deluxe indexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-707-2 (laminated cover, unindexed).

1. English language-Dictionaries. I. Merriam-Webster, Inc.

PE1628.M36 1998 PE1020... 423—dc21

Merriam-Webster's Collegiate® Dictionary, Tenth Edition principal copyright 1993

COLLEGIATE is a registered trademark of Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

All rights reserved. No part of this book covered by the copyrights hereon may be reproduced or copied in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, taping, or information storage and retrieval systems—without written permission of the publisher.

Made in the United States of America

21222324RMcN98

Abbı

DEMONSTRATE PROPERTY.

den.

inc.

Ъr.

13£., ÁZS

äне. 2017. Y. 2. 13.70

108

癫示 SOOn. 3/11 Thur. Tien!

eid:

20t "

600 168.5 35 b W.

een.

Related to

Dr.

161

Brance

en: ិ្សា អាក្ Arm. ्रमाध सम्बद्ध dinori.

6 Harrie at 37. For ¥15.00

ax.

make a motion suggestive of burrowing : SNUGGLE NESTLE (\sim ed against his back for warmth) — bur-row-er n

burrstone var of BUHRSTONE

burrstone var of BUHRSTONE
bur-ry \'bar-e\' adj bur-ri-er; -est (15c) 1 : containing burs 2
: PRICKLY 3 of speech : characterized by a burr
bur-sa \'bar-sa\ n, pl bur-sas \-saz\ or bur-sae \-,sē, -,sī\ [NL, fr. ML,
bag, purse — more at PURSE] (1803) : a bodily pouch or sac: as a : a
small serous sac between a tendon and a bone b: BURSA OF FABRICIUS
bur-seel \-sal\ adi

thus vb bused or bussed; bus-ing or bus-sing vi (ca. 1909) 1: to travel by bus 2: to work as a busboy ~ vi 1: to transport by bus 2 a c.CLAR 4d (~ dishes) b: to remove dirty dishes from (~ tables) bus bar n (1893): a conductor or an assembly of conductors for collecting electric currents and distributing them to outgoing feeders bus-boy (bos-boi) n [omnibus busboy] (1913): a waiter's assistant; specif: one who removes dirty dishes and resets tables in a restaurant bus-by (bos-boi n, pl busbies [prob. fr. the name Busby] (1853) 1: a military full-dress fur hat with a pendent bag on one side usu. of the color of regimental facings 2: the bearskin worn by British guardsmen — not used by the guardsmen themselves

**bush (bush) n, often attrib [ME; akin to OHG busc forest] (14c) 1 a

: \$HRUB; esp: a low densely branched shrub b: a close thicket of shrubs suggesting a single plant 2: a large uncleared or sparsely settled area (as in Australia) usu. scrub-covered or forested: wILDER.

NESS — usu. used with the 3 a archaic: a bunch of ivy formerly hung outside a tavern to indicate wine for sale b obs: TAVERN c: ADVER.

TISING (good wine needs no ~ Shak.) 4: a bushy tuft or mass (a ~ of hair); esp: *2BRUSH 2a 5: MINOR LEAGUE — usu. used in pl.

bush w (15c): to support, mark, or protect with bushes ~ vi: to extend like a bush: resemble a bush

*bush adj (1595) 1: having a low-growing compact bushy habit — used esp. of cultivated beans (~ snap beans) 2: serving, occurring in, or used in the bush (~ planes)

*bush adj (1595) 1: a small Alaco

*bush adj (1590): GALAGO

*bush adj (1501): GALAGO

*bush adj (1501): a sweet basil of a cultivar with small leaves

bush bush (bush-bak) n, pl bushbuck or bushbucks [trans. of Afrik bosbok] (1852): a small African striped antelope (Tragelaphus scriptus) esp. of sub-Saharan forests that has spirally twisted horns

*bush ed (1907): a sweet basil of a cultivar with small leaves

bush bush (bush) Austral a: lost esp. in the bush b: PERPLEXED 1, CONFUSED 3: TIRED. EXHAUSTED

*bus

table 2: a container holding a bushel 3: a large quantity: Lorentz (makes ~s of money)

*bushel vb bush-eled; bush-el-ing \-sh(\sigma)|[prob. fr. G bosseling do poor work, to patch; akin to OE beatan to beat] (ca. 1877): REPAIR REMOVATE — bush-el-er \-sh(\sigma)||ar\ n | bush-fire \'bush-fir\ n (1832) Austral: an uncontrolled fire in a bush-

\'bost\ ured re e head

black 01840 a com 1 slang 2 bust

Dush-Irre \Dush-irr\ n (1852) Austral: an uncontrolled lire in a Dussarea
Bu-shi-do \Du-shi-ndō, 'bū-\ n [Jp bushidō] (1898): a feudal-militar
Japanese code of chivalry valuing honor above life
bush-ing \Du-shin\ n (1839) 1: a usu, removable cylindrical ining
for an opening (as of a mechanical part) used to limit the size of its
opening, resist abrasion, or serve as a guide 2: an electrically insulfating lining for a hole to protect a through conductor
bush jacket n [Ir. its use in rough country] (ca. 1939): a long contejacket resembling a shirt and having four patch pockets and a belt
bush-land \Du-bush-land\ n (1827): \Bush-2
bush-league adj (1914): being of an inferior class or group of its kind
bush league n (1909): MINOR LEAGUE — bush leaguer n
bush-man \Du-bush-mon\ n (1785) 1 cap [modif. of obs. Afrik boschla
a group of short-statured peoples of southern Africa who traditional
live by hunting and foraging b: the Khoisan languages spokeillo
these people 2 a: WOODSMAN b chiefly Austral: a person who live
in the bush
bush-mas-ter \mas-tar\ n (1826); a tropical American pit vip-

live by hunting and foraging b: the Khoisan languages spokent these people 2 a: woodsman b chiefly Austral: a person who his in the bush bush-mas-ter \, mas-ter\ n (1826): a tropical American pit vipe (Lachesis mutus) that is the largest New World venomous snake bush-pig \, pig\ n (1840): a wild usu. reddish to black pig (Potamic choerus porcus) of forests and scrubland of sub-Saharan Africa an Madagascar that has much facial hair, long pointed ears, and a time colored mane along the top of the neck and back bush pilot n (1936): a pilot who flies a small plane into remote areas bush-rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-ing \, ring\ n (1801): n ausu-loose-fittin cotton shirt with patch pockets
bush-in rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the bush rang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er \, rān-jər\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living in the lang-er

CROSS 10: a bowel movement — used esp. of pets sym BUSINESS. COMMERCE. TRADE, INDUSTRY, TRAFFIC mean activity concerned with the supplying and distribution of commodities. BUSINESS may be an inclusive term but specifically designates the activitient of those engaged in the purchase or sale of commodities or relating in transactions. COMMERCE and TRADE imply the exchange at transportation of commodities. INDUSTRY applies to the producing commodities, esp. by manufacturing or processing, usu. on a large scale. TRAFFIC applies to the operation and functioning of public care of goods and persons. sym see in addition work business administration n (ca. 1911): a program of studies in a lege or university providing general knowledge of business principle and practices business card n (1840): a small card bearing information (as name).

business card n (1840): a small card bearing information (as name

business card n (1840): a small card bearing information (as in an address) about a business or business representative business cycle n (1919): a cycle of economic activity usu. consists of recession, recovery, growth, and decline business end n (1878): the end with, from, or through which a thing function is fulfilled (the business end of a revolver) business-like \big\text{"biz-nss-lik}, \noz-\dd\text{ad}\text{ (1791)} 1: exhibiting qualitative to be advantageous in business 2: SERIOUS, PURPOSEPUL believed to be advantageous in business 2: SERIOUS, PURPOSEPUL business-man \man, \man \n (1826): a man who transacts businesses, a business executive business-peo-ple \npe-pe-pl\ n pl (1865): persons active in businesses, business-per-son \npar-s^n\ n (1974): a businessman or businesses woman

pusi-ness-per-son \, npar-s'n\ n\ (19/4): a businessman or busines woman business suit n\ (1870): a man's suit consisting of matching coat an trousers and sometimes a vest busi-ness-wom-an\, wu-man\ n\ (1844): a woman who transac business; esp: a female business executive bus-ing or bus-sing \'bo-sin\ n\ (1923): the act of transporting by bus-specif: the transporting of children to a school outside their residentia area as a means of establishing racial balance in that school busk-er \'bos-k-yr\ n\ [busk\ prob\ fr.\ it\ buscare to procure, gain, fr.\ busk-ar\ to look for\ (1857)\ chiefly\ Brit: a person who entertains espir playing music on the street — busk\'bosk\'vi\ bus-kin\'\bos-kon\ n\ [prob\ modif.\ of\ MF\ brozequin\] (1503) 1 bus-doot reaching halfway or more to the knee 2 a: COTHUNNUS bus-fload\'bos-lod\ n\ (1938): a load that fills a bus \(\sigma \) soft tourists\) bus-man's holiday \'bos-manz-\ n\ (1893): a holiday spent in following or observing the practice of one's usual occupation

Notice of References Cited Application/Control No. 10/743,570 Examiner Applicant(s)/Patent Under Reexamination Art Unit 9age 1 of 1

U.S. PATENT DOCUMENTS

	O.S. FATENT DOCUMENTS					
*		Document Number Country Code-Number-Kind Code	Date MM-YYYY	Name	Classification	
	Α	US-				
	В	US-				
	С	US-				
	D	US-				
	E	US-				
	F	US-				
	G	US-				
	Н	US-				
	_	US-				
	J	US-				
	К	US-				
	L	US-				
	М	US-				

FOREIGN PATENT DOCUMENTS

*		Document Number Country Code-Number-Kind Code	Date MM-YYYY	Country	Name	Classification
	N					
	0					
	Р					
	Q					
	R					
	s					
	Т					

NON-PATENT DOCUMENTS

	NOT I ALERT BOOMETTO						
*		Include as applicable: Author, Title Date, Publisher, Edition or Volume, Pertinent Pages)					
	U	(Webster's) Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary 154 (10 th ed. 1998).					
	V						
	w						
	×						

^{*}A copy of this reference is not being furnished with this Office action. (See MPEP § 707.05(a).)

Dates in MM-YYYY format are publication dates. Classifications may be US or foreign.